Office-Supreme Court, U.S.
FILED
DEC 29 1962
JOHN F. DAVIS, CLERK

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

OCTOBER TERM, 1962

No. 705

FIRST CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH AND SOCIETY OF BURLINGTON, IOWA, FIRST CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH OF PONTIAC, MICHIGAN, FIRST CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH OF WAUWATOSA, WISCONSIN, MAYFAIR CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH OF TOLEDO, OHIO, MALCOLM K. BURTON, BRUCE H. MASSELINK, ANGUS MACDONALD, HARRY R. BUTMAN, GLADYS T. KENNEDY, NORMAN S. MCKENDRICK, ROY W. ABEL, RICHARD H. PLOCK, JOHN G. PRYOR and FREDERICK GRABOW, suing on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Petitioners,

against

EVANGELICAL AND REFORMED CHURCH, JOHN T. BEACH, as Treasurer and a member of THE GENERAL COUNCIL OF THE CONGREGATIONAL CHRISTIAN CHURCHES OF THE UNITED STATES, THE BOARD OF HOME MISSIONS OF THE CONGREGATIONAL AND CHRISTIAN CHURCHES, THE AMERICAN MISSIONARY ASSOCIATION, THE CONGREGATIONAL HOME MISSIONARY SOCIETY, THE CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH BUILDING SOCIETY, THE CONGREGATIONAL SUNDAY SCHOOL EXTENSION SOCIETY, THE CONGREGATIONAL BOARD OF MINISTERIAL RELIEF, CONGREGATIONAL EDUCATION SOCIETY, CONGREGATIONAL PUBLISHING SOCIETY, THE ANNUITY FUND FOR CONGREGATIONAL MINISTERS, RETIREMENT FUND FOR LAY WORKERS, THE CORPORATION FOR THE GENERAL COUNCIL OF THE CONGREGATIONAL CHRISTIAN CHURCHES OF THE UNITED STATES, and AMERICAN BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS FOR FOREIGN MISSIONS,

Respondents,

JOHN T. BEACH, as Treasurer of the NATIONAL COUNCIL OF CONGREGATIONAL CHURCHES and FRED HOSKINS and JAMES E. WAGNER, as co-Presidents of the UNITED CHURCH OF CHRIST,

Added Respondents.

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

KENNETH W. GREENAWALT,
2 Broadway, New York 4, N. Y.

ROBERT C. C. HEANEY,
Michigan Trust Building,
Grand Rapids 2, Michigan,
Attorneys for Petitioners.

THOMAS T. ADAMS,
WILLIAM K. VAN'T HOF,
Of Counsel.

INDEX

	PAGE
Citations to Opinions Below	2
Jurisdiction	2
Questions Presented	3
Statutes Involved	4
Statement of the Case	4
1. Judgment Sought to be Reviewed	4
2. General Nature of Action	5
3. Proceedings Below	7
4. Background of the Controversy	9
5. Proceedings in *Cadman* v. *Kenyon*	12
6. Events Since *Cadman*	14
7. The Importance of the Case	16
Reasons for Granting Writ	17
(1) The Court of Appeals Has Rendered a Decision Which Is In Conflict With Applicable Decisions of the Supreme Court, and Has Deprived Petitioners of Their Constitutional Rights of Due Process of Law	17
(2) The Courts Below Have Decided Important Questions of New York Law In a Way In Conflict With the Applicable Law of New York	23
(3) The Courts Below Have Deprived Plaintiffs of Due Process of Law In Violation of the Fifth or Fourteenth Amendments In Holding, Contrary to Decisions of This Court and the Law of New York, That They Are Bound By "Adjudications" In *Cadman* v. *Kenyon*, To Which They Were Not a Party and in Which They Were Not and Could Not Have Been Represented	33

PAGE

(4) The Court of Appeals Has Sanctioned a Course of Conduct By the District Court Which Deprived Petitioners of Procedural Due Process of Law and So Far Departed from the Accepted Course of Judicial Proceedings As to Call For the Exercise of the Supervisory Powers of This Court 37

(5) The Issues and the Legal Questions Involved in This Case are of Great and Far-reaching Importance 41

Conclusion 41

Appendix A X1

Appendix B X3

Appendix C X14

Appendix D X17

Appendix E X20

Appendix F X22

TABLE OF CASES CITED

Angel v. *Bullington*, 330 U. S. 183 (1947) 23, 33

Attorney General v. *Town of Dublin*, 38 N.H. 459 (1859) 10

Bank of Yorktown v. *Boland*, 172 Misc. 885, 16 N. Y. S. 2d 756; aff'd 259 App. Div. 987, aff'd 284 N. Y. 749 (1940) 26

B. & O. R. Co. v. *U. S.*, 298 U. S. 349 (1935) 40

Bouton v. *Van Buren*, 229 N. Y. 17, 127 N.E. 477 (1920) 37

Brenner v. *Title Guarantee & Trust Co.*, 276 N. Y. 230, 11 N.E. 2nd 890 (1937) 35, 36, 37

Brinkerhoff-Faris Co. v. *Hill*, 281 U. S. 673, 679-80 (1930) 23

Cadman Memorial Congregational Soc. of Brooklyn v. *Kenyon*, 197 Misc. 124, 95 N. Y. S. 2d 133 (1950) rev. 279 App. Div. 1015, 1074, 111 N. Y. S. 2d 808 (1952), aff'd 306 N. Y. 151, 116 N.E. 2d 481 (1953) 3, 4, 7, 8, 11, 12, 14, 15, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39

PAGE

City Bank Farmers Trust Co. v. *Macfadden*, 13 App. Div. 2d 395, 216 N. Y. S. 2d 215 (1st Dept. 1961) 25, 27, 31

City of New York, Matter of (A. & W. Realty Corp.), 1 N. Y. 2d 428, 154 N. Y. S. 2d 1 (1956) 26

Commercial Publishing Co. v. *Beckwith*, 188 U. S. 567 (1903) 18, 21

Cook v. *Conners*, 215 N. Y. 175, 109 N.E. 78 (1915) 25

Costello v. *U. S.*, 365 U. S. 265 (1961) 18, 20, 21

Cromwell v. *County of Sac.*, 94 U. S. 351 (1876) 18, 21, 25, 32

Fidelity National Bank v. *Swope*, 274 U. S. 123 (1927) 23

First Cong. Church v. *Evangelical and Reformed Church*, 160 F. Supp. 651 (1958); 198 F. Supp. 677 (1961) 16, 23

Davies v. *Stumpf*, 262 App. Div. 499, 31 N. Y. S. 2d 1000 (1st Dept. 1941) 32

Gart v. *Cole*, 166 F. Supp. 129, aff'd 263 F. 2d 244 (2nd Cir. 1959) 32

Good Health Dairy Products Corp. v. *Emery*, 275 N. Y. 14, 9 N.E. 2d 758 (1937) 25, 31

Gray-Lewis v. *Gray-Lewis*, not officially reported, 157 N. Y. S. 2d 815 (N. Y. Co. 1956) 26

Gudmundson v. *Thingvalla Lutheran Church*, 29 N.D. 291, 150 N.W. 750 (1915) 10

Haldeman v. *U. S.*, 91 U. S. 584 (1875) 18, 21

Hansberry v. *Lee*, 311 U. S. 32 (1940) 19, 21, 34, 35, 36, 37

Harriman v. *Northern Securities Co.*, 197 U. S. 244 (1905) 19, 21

Harrington v. *Harrington*, 290 N. Y. 126, 48 N.E. 2d 290 (1943) 26

House v. *Mullen*, 22 Wall. (89 U. S.) 42 (1874) 18, 20

Hughes v. *United States*, 4 Wall. (71 U. S.) 232 (1866) 18, 20

Israel v. *Wood Dolson Co.*, 1 N. Y. 2d 116, 134 N.E. 2d 97 (1956) 25, 31

Joint Anti-Fascist Refugee Comm. v. *McGrath*, 341 U. S. 123 (1950) 40

PAGE

Kittinger v. *Churchill*, 161 Misc. 3, 292 N. Y. S. 35, aff'd 249 App. Div. 703, 292 N. Y. S. 51 (4th Dept. 1936) 25

Kovarsky v. *Brooklyn Union Gas Co.*, 279 N. Y. 304, 18 N.E. 2d 287 (1938) 37

Lipkind v. *Ward*, 256 App. Div. 74, 8 N. Y. S. 2d 832 (3rd Dept. 1939) 25

Manhattan Storage & Warehouse Co. v. *Movers Assn.*, 289 N. Y. 82, 43 N.E. 2d 820 (1942) 19, 29, 30

Mullane v. *McKenzie*, 269 N. Y. 369 (1936) 31

Murray v. *Pocatello*, 226 U. S. 318 (1912) 18, 19, 20, 21, 31

People ex rel. MacCracken v. *Miller*, 291 N. Y. 55, 50 N.E. 2d 542 (1943) 26

People v. *McCanliss*, 255 N. Y. 456, 175 N. E. 129 (1931) 30

Postal Telegraph Cable Co. v. *City of Newport, Kentucky*, 247 U. S. 464 (1918) 18, 21, 33, 34

Purcell v. *Summers*, 126 F. 2d 390 (4th Cir. 1942) affirming 34 F. Supp. 421 (1940); cert. den. 317 U. S. 640 (1942) 16, 22

Ripley v. *Storer*, 309 N. Y. 506, 132 N.E. 2d 87 (1956) 31

Rudd v. *Cornell*, 171 N. Y. 114, 63 N.E. 823 (1902)....25, 27

Russell v. *Place*, 94 U. S. 606 (1876) 18, 21

St. Romes v. *Levee Steam Cotton Press Co.*, 127 U. S. 614 (1888) 18, 20

Salzman v. *Sakofsky*, 195 Misc. 166, 89 N. Y. S. 2d 39 (Bronx Co. 1949) 30

Schuylkill Fuel Corp. v. *Nieberg*, N. Y. 304, 307 (1929) 31

Siegel v. *Finnerman*, 282 App. Div. 878, 124 N. Y. S. 2d 846 (2nd Dept. 1953) 20, 28

Silberstein v. *Silberstein*, 218 N. Y. 525, 113 N.E. 495 (1916) 30

Soc. Milion Athena, Inc. v. *National Bank of Greece*, 281 N. Y. 282, 22 N.E. 2d 374 (1939) 37

Stokes v. *Stokes*, 155 N. Y. 581, 50 N.E. 242 (1898) 31

Swift v. *McPherson*, 232 U. S. 51 (1914) 18, 20

PAGE

TCF Film Corporation v. *Gourley*, 240 F. 2d 711 (3rd Cir. 1957) 38
Terner v. *City of Peekskill*, not officially reported, 124 N. Y. S. 2d 24 (1953) 20, 28
Third National Bank of Louisville v. *Stone*, 174 U. S. 432 (1899) 31
Wabash Railroad v. *Adelbert College*, 208 U. S. 38 (1908) 37
Walfrice v. *Buffalo Pottery Co.*, 176 Misc. 472, 27 N. Y. S. 2d 487 (Erie Co. 1941) 30
Watson v. *Jones*, 13 Wall. (80 U. S.) 679 (1871) 10
Weissmann v. *Euker*, 1 App. Div. 2d 30, 147 N. Y. S. 2d 101 (3rd Dept. 1955) 24
Wood v. *City of Salamanca*, 289 N. Y. 279, 45 N.E. 2d 443 (1942) 19, 29, 30

Statutes

United States Const.

Fifth Amendment 4, 33, 37
Fourteenth Amendment 4, 33, 37

28 U. S. C. §1254(1) 3
§1332 5
§2201 ..... 4, 5

Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule 43(c) 9, 40

New York Civil Practice Act:

§193 ..... 4, 19, 21, 29
§472 ..... 4, 30
§473 ..... 4, 19, 21, 26, 29, 30

New York Const. Art. VI, §7 ..... 4, 26

New York Rules of Civil Practice

Rule 21f 4

Authorities

PAGE

American Law Reports:

Vol. 132, p. 750 35

Borchard, *Declaratory Judgments*, 2nd Ed. pp. 312-14, 686 16

Carmody-Wait, Cyclopedia of New York Practice:

Vol. 7, §§186-194 25
Vol. 9, §226, p. 427 26

Moore's Federal Practice:

Vol. 3, Par. 23.04 35

Restatement of Judgments:

§77(b) 21, 25

Sweet, *Religion in America* (1942), p. 68 10

United Church Herald, Vol. 5, No. 19, p. 18 (Oct. 18, 1962) 16

Wigmore on Evidence, 3rd Ed. Vol. IX 39

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

OCTOBER TERM, 1962

No.

FIRST CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH AND SOCIETY OF BURLINGTON, IOWA, FIRST CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH OF PONTIAC, MICHIGAN, FIRST CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH OF WAUWATOSA, WISCONSIN, MAYFAIR CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH OF TOLEDO, OHIO, MALCOLM K. BURTON, BRUCE H. MASSELINK, ANGUS MACDONALD, HARRY R. BUTMAN, GLADYS T. KENNEDY, NORMAN S. MCKENDRICK, ROY W. ABEL, RICHARD H. PLOCK, JOHN G. PRYOR and FREDERICK GRABOW, suing on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Petitioners,

against

EVANGELICAL AND REFORMED CHURCH, JOHN T. BEACH, as Treasurer and a member of THE GENERAL COUNCIL OF THE CONGREGATIONAL CHRISTIAN CHURCHES OF THE UNITED STATES, THE BOARD OF HOME MISSIONS OF THE CONGREGATIONAL AND CHRISTIAN CHURCHES, THE AMERICAN MISSIONARY ASSOCIATION, THE CONGREGATIONAL HOME MISSIONARY SOCIETY, THE CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH BUILDING SOCIETY, THE CONGREGATIONAL SUNDAY SCHOOL EXTENSION SOCIETY, THE CONGREGATIONAL BOARD OF MINISTERIAL RELIEF, CONGREGATIONAL EDUCATION SOCIETY, CONGREGATIONAL PUBLISHING SOCIETY, THE ANNUITY FUND FOR CONGREGATIONAL MINISTERS, RETIREMENT FUND FOR LAY WORKERS, THE CORPORATION FOR THE GENERAL COUNCIL OF THE CONGREGATIONAL CHRISTIAN CHURCHES OF THE UNITED STATES, and AMERICAN BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS FOR FOREIGN MISSIONS,

Respondents.

JOHN T. BEACH, as Treasurer of the NATIONAL COUNCIL OF CONGREGATIONAL CHURCHES and FRED HOSKINS and JAMES E. WAGNER, as co-Presidents of the UNITED CHURCH OF CHRIST,

Added Respondents.

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

Petitioners pray that a writ of certiorari issue to review the judgment of the United States Court of Appeals for